# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 5, Number 1, Winter 1996

## CONTENTS

From the Editors	1
Contributors	4
Special Section: Physician-Aided Death: The Escalating Debate	
Encounters With Death DAVID A. BENNAHUM	7
Legalizing Physician-Aided Death ALEXANDER M. CAPRON	10
Setting Limits on Death: A View From the United States SANDRA H. JOHNSON	24
A Middle Ground on Physician-Assisted Suicide James A. Tulsky, Ann Alpers, and Bernard Lo	33
Should Physicians Assist the Reaper? JORAM GRAF HABER	44
Living Versus Dying "With Dignity": A New Perspective on the Euthanasia Debate Том Косн	50
An Analysis of Arguments for and Against Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide: Part One David C. Thomasma	62
Narratives From The Netherlands "The Moment Will Come When I Can Only Love Him by Killing Him." "What Is There to Be Frightened About? After All, It's Not Like I Am Going to the Dentist!" "The Euthanasia Mountain Gets Higher and Higher."	77 83 87
Physician-Assisted Suicide and the Dutch Courts J. K. M. Gevers	93
Euthanasia in The Netherlands: The Role of the Dutch Medical Profession R. J. M. DILLMANN	100
Teaching Euthanasia: The Integration of the Practice of Euthanasia Into the Grief, Death, and Dying Curricula of Postgraduate Family Medicine Training Gerrit K. Kimsma and B. J. van Duin	107
Physician Aid-in-Dying: Toward a "Harm Reduction" Approach STEVE HEILIG AND STEPHEN JAMISON	113
The Role of Institutional and Community Based Ethics Committees in the Debate on Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide ROBERT L. SCHWARTZ AND THOMASINE KUSHNER	121
CQ Interview Margaret Battin, Howard Brody, Patricia Marshall, and Robyn Shapiro on Physician-Aided Death	
DANA SWARTZBERG	131
CQ Sources/Bibliography David A. Buehler	138

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 5, Number 1, Winter 1996

## CONTENTS

From the Editors	1
Contributors	4
Special Section: Physician-Aided Death: The Escalating Debate	
Encounters With Death DAVID A. BENNAHUM	7
Legalizing Physician-Aided Death ALEXANDER M. CAPRON	10
Setting Limits on Death: A View From the United States SANDRA H. JOHNSON	24
A Middle Ground on Physician-Assisted Suicide James A. Tulsky, Ann Alpers, and Bernard Lo	33
Should Physicians Assist the Reaper? JORAM GRAF HABER	44
Living Versus Dying "With Dignity": A New Perspective on the Euthanasia Debate Том Косн	50
An Analysis of Arguments for and Against Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide: Part One David C. Thomasma	62
Narratives From The Netherlands "The Moment Will Come When I Can Only Love Him by Killing Him." "What Is There to Be Frightened About? After All, It's Not Like I Am Going to the Dentist!" "The Euthanasia Mountain Gets Higher and Higher."	77 83 87
Physician-Assisted Suicide and the Dutch Courts J. K. M. Gevers	93
Euthanasia in The Netherlands: The Role of the Dutch Medical Profession R. J. M. DILLMANN	100
Teaching Euthanasia: The Integration of the Practice of Euthanasia Into the Grief, Death, and Dying Curricula of Postgraduate Family Medicine Training Gerrit K. Kimsma and B. J. van Duin	107
Physician Aid-in-Dying: Toward a "Harm Reduction" Approach STEVE HEILIG AND STEPHEN JAMISON	113
The Role of Institutional and Community Based Ethics Committees in the Debate on Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide ROBERT L. SCHWARTZ AND THOMASINE KUSHNER	121
CQ Interview Margaret Battin, Howard Brody, Patricia Marshall, and Robyn Shapiro on Physician-Aided Death	
DANA SWARTZBERG	131
CQ Sources/Bibliography David A. Buehler	138

#### Volume 4 Contents Departments and Columns Responses and Dialogue Euthanasia in Japan: Update (CQ Vol. 2, No. 1) KAZUMASA HOSHINO 144 Ethics Committees at Work Comparing Two Euthanasia Protocols: The Free University of Amsterdam Academic Hospital and the Medical Center of Alkmaar GERRIT K. KIMSMA AND EVERT VAN LEEUWEN 145 The Caduceus in Court Rights of the Terminally III Act of the Australian Northern Territory 157 ROBERT L. SCHWARTZ Network News Georgia Ethics Committee Consortium: A Statewide Dialogue KATHY KINLAW 167 Health Policy Watch Situation Ethics and Incremental Reform of American Health Delivery Systems JOSEPH C. D'ORONZIO 169 CQ Review NANCY S. JECKER The Crisis of Care: Affirming and Restoring Caring Practices in the Helping Professions by Susan S. Phillips and Patricia Benner, Eds. Reviewed by CLARENCE H. BRADDOCK III 173 Caring in Crisis: An Oral History of Critical Care Nursing by Jacqueline Zalumas Reviewed by SARAH E. SHANNON 174 Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature KENNETH V. ISERSON 178

# Volume 5, Number 2, Spring 1996

#### CONTENTS

Erom the Editore

From the Editors	101
Contributors	184
Special Section: Issues in Consent	
Secrets of the Couch and the Grave: The Anne Sexton Case EDMUND D. PELLEGRINO	189
Must Physicians Reveal Their Wounds? BARRY R. FURROW	204
Informed Consent Revisited Amnon Goldworth	214
How Important Is Consent for Controlled Clinical Trials? BARBARA MACKINNON	221
Determinants of Decision Making for Circumcision CHRIS CIESIELSKI-CARLUCCI, NANCY MILLIKEN, AND NEAL H. COHEN	228

Informed Consent Issues in International Research Concerns JOAN P. PORTER	237
CQ Sources/Bibliography DAVID A. BUEHLER	244
Articles	
Is the Treatment Beneficial, Experimental, or Futile?  LAWRENCE J. SCHNEIDERMAN AND NANCY S. JECKER	248
Exploring the Role of Religion in Medical Ethics DAVID C. THOMASMA AND ERICH H. LOEWY	257
Measurement of Moral Development in Medicine DONNIE J. SELF AND EVI DAVENPORT	269
Departments and Columns	
Responses and Dialogue From a Dutch Perspective: Response to "Rights of the Terminally III Act of the Australian Northern Territory" by Robert L. Schwartz (CQ Vol 5, No 1)	
GERRIT K. KIMSMA AND EVERT VAN LEEUWEN	278
Organs for Undocumented Aliens—Another Look: Response to "Distributing American Hearts for Transplantation: The Predicament of Living in the Global Village" by Henry S. Perkins (CQ Vol 4, No 2) RICHARD A. DEMME	281
Task Force on Standards for Ethics Consultation: Response to "Ethics Consultation: The Least Dangerous Profession?" (CQ Vol 2, No 4) ROBERT ARNOLD AND STUART J. YOUNGNER	284
Ethics Committees at Work Reflections on Non-Heartbeating Organ Donation: How 3 Years of Experience Affected the University of Pittsburgh's	
Ethics Committee's Actions MICHAEL DEVITA AND JAMES V. SNYDER Commentary: Trial-and-Error Ethics: Experimenting With Non-Heartbeating Cadaver Organ Donation	285
RENEE C. Fox Commentary: Bending the Rules That Bent the Rules STUART J. YOUNGNER	292 296
Genethics Charles R. MacKay Orphan Tests Leslie G. Biesecker	300
Canadian Perspective The Canadian Question: What's So Great About Intelligence? Том Косн	
CQ Reviews NANCY S. JECKER Rethinking Life and Death: The Collapse of Our Traditional Ethics by Peter Singer	307
Reviewed by Idram Haber	311

Final Acts of Love: Families, Friends, and Assisted Dying by Stephen Jamison Reviewed by WILLIAM A. ATCHLEY 313 Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature KENNETH V. ISERSON 316 Volume 5, Number 3, Summer 1996 CONTENTS From the Editors 319 Contributors 321 Special Section: Rejuvenating Research Ethics Public Science and Norms of Truthfulness LOUIS M. GUENIN 325 Evolving Ethical Issues in Selection of Subjects for Clinical Research CHARLES WEIIER 334 For Her Own Good: Protecting (and Neglecting) Women in Research **EVELYNE SHUSTER** 346 Incompetent Persons as Research Subjects and the Ethics of Minimal Risk KATHLEEN CRANLEY GLASS AND MARC SPEYER-OFENBERG 362 Ethical Concerns About Relapse Studies ADIL E. SHAMOO AND TIMOTHY J. KEAY 373 Drug Trials, Doctors, and Developing Countries: Toward a Legal Definition of Informed Consent ADINA M. NEWMAN 387 Patient Access to Experimental Drugs and AIDS Clinical Trial Designs: Ethical Issues UDO SCHÜKLENK AND CARLTON HOGAN 400 The Ethical Problems of the Open Label Extension Study KENNETH CRAIG MICETICH 410 CQ Interview Stanton Glantz on Snuffing Tobacco Research THOMASINE KUSHNER 415 CQ Sources/Bibliography DAVID A. BUEHLER 422 Articles What Is the Proper Role for Charity in Healthcare? FELICIA ACKERMAN 425 Reflections on Adoption Ethics 430 STEPHEN G. POST Commentary on "Reflections on Adoption" Relinquishment and Adoption: Are They Genuine Options? MARY B. MAHOWALD 437

VII

Except in Emergencies: AMA Ethics and Physician Autonom CHALMERS C. CLARK	ny 440
Further Exploration of the Relationship Between Medical Ed Moral Development	
DONNIE J. SELF, DEWITT C. BALDWIN, JR., AND FREDRIC D. W	OLINSKY 444
Departments and Columns	
Responses and Dialogue Response to "Germ-Line Therapy to Cure Mitochondrial Disand Ethics of In Vitro Ovum Nuclear Transplantation" by Donald S. Rubenstein, David C. Thomasma, Eric A. Schoand Michael J. Zinaman (CQ Vol 4, No 3) Dimensions and Classification of Genetic Interventions in the MATTHEW D. BACCHETTA AND GERD RICHTER	on,
Ethics Committees at Work	
Physician Experience as a Measure of Competency: Implicate for Informed Consent	ons
Paul B. Hofmann	458
Commentaries WILLIAM NELSON AND PAUL B. HOFMANN	459
NEAL COHEN	462
ROBERT L. SCHWARTZ	464
Health Policy Watch Second, Let No Harm Be Done: An American Antiimmigrati JOSEPH C. D'ORONZIO	ion Dilemma 467
CQ Review NANCY S. JECKER Ethics and Perinatology by Amnon Goldworth, William Silvers David K. Stevenson, and Ernlé Young, Eds.	man,
Reviewed by SAMUEL GOROVITZ	473
Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature Kenneth V. Iserson	476
Volume 5, Number 4, Fall 1996	
CONTENTS	
From the Editors	479
Guest Editorial	
RICHARD M. ZANER, MARK J. BLITON, AND STUART G. FINDER	480
Contributors	482
Special Section: Can Justice Endure Healthcare Reform?: From Patient Care to Policy (and Back Again)	
Seeking Justice for Priscilla	
JOHN LANTOS	485

Recapturing Justice in the Managed Care Era JONATHAN D. MORENO	493
Caring for "Socially Undesirable" Patients NANCY S. JECKER	500
Justice and the Individual in the Hippocratic Tradition RICHARD M. ZANER	511
The Eclipse of the Individual in Policy (Where is the Place for Justice?) MARK J. BLITON AND STUART G. FINDER	519
CQ Sources/Bibliography DAVID A. BUEHLER	533
Articles	
Allocating Healthcare by QALYs: The Relevance of Age John McKie, Helga Kuhse, Jeff Richardson, and Peter Singer	534
The Economic Attributes of Medical Care: Implications for Rationing Choices in the United States and United Kingdom DWAYNE A. BANKS	546
Justice, Society, Physicians and Ethics Committees: Incorporating Ideas of Justice into Patient Care Decisions ERICH H. LOEWY	559
The Ethical Neutrality of Prospective Payments:  Justice Issues  Jean McDowell	570
JEAN MCDOWELL	3/0
Departments and Columns	
CQ Interview REBECCA REICHMANN on Women's Health and Reproductive Rights in Brazil STEVE HEILIG	579
CO Review	0,,
NANCY S. JECKER The Patient in the Family: An Ethics of Medicine and Families, by Hilde Lindemann Nelson and James Lindemann Nelson Reviewed by JULIEN S. MURPHY	582
Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature	
Kenneth V. Iserson	585

Author Index and Contents for Volume 5